



**City of Palm Coast
Minutes
COUNCIL BUSINESS
MEETING**

City Hall
160 Lake Avenue
Palm Coast, FL 32164
www.palmcoastgov.com

**Mayor David Alfin
Vice Mayor Eddie Branquinho
Council Member Ed Danko
Council Member John Fanelli III
Council Member Nick Klufas**

Tuesday, April 19, 2022

9:00 AM

COMMUNITY WING

City Staff

**Denise Bevan, City Manager
Neysa Borkert, City Attorney
Virginia A. Smith, City Clerk**

- Public Participation shall be in accordance with Section 286.0114 Florida Statutes.
- Other matters of concern may be discussed as determined by City Council.
- If you wish to obtain more information regarding the City Council's agenda, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 386-986-3713.
- In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act and Section 286.26, Florida Statutes, persons needing a reasonable accommodation to participate in any of these proceedings or meeting should contact the City Clerk at 386-986-3713, at least 48 hours prior to the meeting.
- City Council Meetings are streamed live on YouTube at <https://www.youtube.com/user/PalmCoastGovTV/live>.
- It is proper meeting etiquette to silence all electronic devices, including cell phones while meeting is in session.
- Any person who decides to appeal any decision of the City Council with respect to any matter considered at this meeting will need a record of the proceedings, and for such purpose, may need to hire a court reporter to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based.

A. CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Alfin called the meeting to order at 9:00 AM.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG

C. ROLL CALL

City Clerk Virginia Smith called the roll. All members were present.

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Public Participation shall be held in accordance with Section 286.0114 Florida Statutes. And pursuant to the City Council's Meeting Policies and Procedures:

- (1) Each speaker shall at the podium, provide their name and may speak for up to 3 minutes.

(2) The Public may provide comments to the City Council relative to matters not on the agenda at the times indicated in this Agenda. Following any comments from the public, there may be discussion by the City Council.

(3) When addressing the City Council on specific, enumerated Agenda items, speakers shall:

(a) direct all comments to the Mayor;

(b) make their comments concise and to the point;

(c) not speak more than once on the same subject;

(d) not, by speech or otherwise, delay or interrupt the proceedings or the peace of the City Council;

(e) obey the orders of the Mayor or the City Council; and

(f) not make any irrelevant, impertinent or slanderous comments while addressing the City Council; which pursuant to Council rules, shall be considered disorderly.

(4) Any person who becomes disorderly or who fails to confine his or her comments to the identified subject or business, shall be cautioned by the Mayor and thereafter must conclude his or her remarks on the subject within the remaining designated time limit.

Any speaker failing to comply, as cautioned, shall be barred from making any additional comments during the meeting and may be removed, as necessary, for the remainder of the meeting portions of the agenda at the times indicated by the Chair during the meeting.

E. MINUTES

Mike Martin-commend you on your recognition of the volunteers for Palm Coast. Urge you to practice what you preach, and volunteer your time for Palm Coast.

Robert MacDonald-exit door issue - this morning, as I brought up last week, there are people who still feel that because of who they are they can come through the metal detector without security. They are not allowed to carry a weapon into the building. That is the purpose of the metal detector. What will stop them from entering the building if they are disgruntled? What are the legal ramifications? It is useless if people feel they can come through that entrance, during or prior to the meeting.

Steve Carr-Florida Park Drive traffic issues.

David Shank-new residents, thanked all for their service to the City. We are here to assist in any capacity. Not ready to sit in your seat though.

Al Krier-Committee for Safety on Cimmaron. You have listened to all people concerned for this safety for almost a year. We decided on moving forward, one presenter to City Council. Closes this way: this is a good place to live and I like it here.

Darlene Shelly-Hidden Lakes-asked for a moratorium on projects for Old Kings Road. Accidents continue on Old Kings Road.

Robert Skove-safety on Old Kings Road. Was FDOT consulted? Was FCSO? Were the State Police?

Mayor Alfin-(to Ms. Bevan)-Will you follow up regarding the safety of our meetings and the building and follow up with the resident and to Council, please?

VM Branquinho-thanked Mr. Shank and welcomed him here to Palm Coast. Two people he loves are Al Krier and Mr. MacDonald. Spoke of the security issues.

CM Klufas-thanked Mr. Shank for his service and welcomed him to Palm Coast.

CM Fanelli-welcome to Mr. Shank to Palm Coast.

- 1. MINUTES OF THE CITY COUNCIL:
APRIL 5, 2022 BUSINESS MEETING
APRIL 12, 2022 WORKSHOP MEETING**

Pass

Motion made to approve by Vice Mayor Branquinho and seconded by Council Member Klufas

Approved - 5 - Mayor David Alfin, Vice Mayor Eddie Branquinho, Council Member Ed Danko, Council Member Nick Klufas, Council Member John Fanelli III

F. PRESENTATIONS AND PROCLAMATIONS

- 2. PROCLAMATION - COMMUNITY VOLUNTEER MONTH**

Mayor Alfin presented the Proclamation to our volunteers.

- 3. PROCLAMATION - NATIONAL PUBLIC SAFETY TELECOMMUNICATORS WEEK**

Mayor Alfin presented this Proclamation to the Public Safety Telecommunicators.

- 4. PROCLAMATION - APRIL AS SEXUAL ASSAULT AWARENESS MONTH**

CM Fanelli presented this Proclamation to representatives of the Family Life Center. Ms. Trish Giaccone thanked Council for their support.

- 5. PROCLAMATION - NATIONAL CRIME VICTIMS' RIGHTS WEEK APRIL 24, 2022 THROUGH APRIL 30, 2022**

CM Branquinho presented this Proclamation to representatives from the Flagler County Advocate Alliance. Ms. Michelle from the Flagler Beach Police Department thanked Council for their support.

- 6. PRESENTATION - VOLUNTEER FIRE FIGHTER SERVICE AWARDS**

CM Klufas and Mr. Tim Wilsey presented three 30 year awards to Volunteer Firefighters: Michelle LaMonica, Jim Lee and Howard Peiffer.

7. PRESENTATION - EMPLOYEE RECOGNITION

Ms. Brittany Kershaw presented to Council on employee recognition.

G. RESOLUTIONS

8. RESOLUTION 2022-XX APPROVING A WORK ORDER WITH ENGLAND-THIMS & MILLER, INC. TO PROVIDE ENGINEERING SERVICES FOR FINAL WATER QUALITY MONITORING PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION

R20220055

Ms. Bevan provided a brief overview of the item.

Mayor Alfin-Are there awards the City receives for our water? Ms. Bevan-Yes, we have received an award for the best drinking water in Florida.

Council all commented on the great quality of water and the hard work that our employees put in to make the water available at the highest quality level.

Public Comments:

Mike Martin-urge all of you that we cannot outgrow our aquifer.

Paula Lewis-appreciates the water quality information that is presented. I do not think we have standardized water across the board. The water in the C section is golden in color. We installed a reverse osmosis system. There is no way this is good water. We are on an older water system. The quality is better in the newer areas.

Ms. Bevan requested Mr. Flanagan explain the standards for water quality. Color does not cause the quality of water. In peak demands and dry times, it forces the City to use the wellfields which do have a higher color content. Color is not a safety issue.

CM Klufas asked Mr. Flanagan to provide an overview with St. John's River Water Management relationship and the aquifers.

Mr. Flanagan explained the close relationship with SJRWMD regarding the consumptive use permits. Urged residents and all to take the pledge to help protect our most precious commodity-our water, the aquifer.

Patrick DeSordo-I have been a resident of Palm Coast 40 years and the water since I moved here was always #1. Water conservation-Belle Terre Parkway in the pouring rain, is constantly on. Why can't we shut them off. Even if it is reclaimed water, where does it come from, the aquifer.

CM Klufas provided an answer regarding the sprinklers staying on.

Pass

Motion made to approve by Vice Mayor Branquinho and seconded by Council Member Fanelli III

Approved - 5 - Mayor David Alfin, Vice Mayor Eddie Branquinho, Council Member Ed Danko, Council Member Nick Klufas, Council Member John Fanelli III

H. ORDINANCES SECOND READ

9. ORDINANCE 2022-XX AMENDMENTS TO THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN BASED ON EVALUATION AND APPRAISAL PROCESS

O20220009

Attorney Borkert read the title of the Ordinance into the record.

Mr. Jose Papa presented to City Council on this item.

Discussion included the education, community input, and future challenges as the City grows. Preparing for the future vision of Palm Coast.

Public Comments:

Steve Carr-part of the Comprehensive Plan is zoning and the protection of residents. Traffic issues throughout.

Mark Lewis-maintain the salt water canals.

Patrick Miller-make sure the plan is followed by Council, staff, and the manager.

Mayor Alfin requested the Attorney provide an overview regarding the adoption of property rights elements as laid out in the statutes.

Pass

Motion made to be adopted on second reading by Council Member Fanelli III and seconded by Council Member Danko

Approved - 5 - Mayor David Alfin, Vice Mayor Eddie Branquinho, Council Member Ed Danko, Council Member Nick Klufas, Council Member John Fanelli III

10. ORDINANCE 2022-XX PURSUANT TO ARTICLE IV, SECTION 6 OF THE CITY OF PALM COAST CHARTER, ADOPTING AN INCREASE TO THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS' COMPENSATION

O20220010

City Attorney Neysa Borkert read the title into the record.

VM Branquinho did not agree with the raise and shared response to comments regarding the raise. We should listen to the people of Palm Coast. What I've heard is that people are not in favor of this.

Council Member Klufas reiterated his opinion on this item. It is hard to form a diverse opinion when we have people from the same backgrounds. We need a more diverse opinion to include the working class. They represent a large cross-section of our community. It will promote overall success.

Council Member Danko reiterated CM Klufas comments.

CM Fanelli shared conversations he had with residents regarding the increase. Many residents are unaware of how little Council makes.

CM Fanelli made a motion to amend the Ordinance. Compared likewise cities. Motion to amend the salaries to Mayor-\$30,039.47 and Council-\$24,087.61.

Part 2, moving forward, we never find ourselves in this situation again. A 3% increase to employees also goes to City Council.

Part 3 to include Council and Mayor in City employee benefits. Option to receive money in salary compensation if they do not need the health benefits.

Motion to change the amount of compensation to \$30,039.47 for Mayor, \$24,097.61 for Council, any increase to City employees COLA would apply to Council and Mayor salary, each member of City Council eligible to receive group health and benefits program at the benefit level of general City employees and if they decline the benefits, they can receive the compensation.

Second by CM Klufas.

VM Branquinho those 16 cities, were they strong Mayor? Ans: CM Fanelli: No, I eliminated the strong mayor form of government.

Mayor Alfin shared appreciation for the approaches thus far. My question: should a resident's ability and availability to serve be dependent on their financial wealth? Do we restrict our candidates from running for office and serving the community on their financial wealth?

Public Comment:

Sue Urban-eliminating me from being able to run for Council. I am disabled. By increasing this it eliminates me. I cannot make that income by law. By running for office, you are not a City employee. You are volunteering for this position. You knew this when you ran for this office. Shared numbers, 18K per year seems fair. Offensive to ask for a raise when the people in this room are struggling to make it.

Robert MacDonald-30 years worked at the United Postal Service, biggest discussion was always benefits. How much will those benefits cost? How long will those benefits be provided after the term is complete? We have a sitting Councilman who is sitting on second term. Decided to do it again at the current wage. Another who said won't do anything to increase tax. Had another who said it won't affect me. VM is the only one who is standing up saying this is wrong. Mayor- this doesn't work. We have 40 people in the room. 5 people get to decide

what 95K people pay for. Why now? Why did you decide now to go for a raise? You didn't ask for a raise when you were all elected. It's not right.

Mike Martin-the fact that you're all sitting there proves that people are willing to work for the current salary. We have a CM- you should not be working full time. The salary is set up this way because we have a weak mayor and weak Council. Only people who succeed you will get this raise. It comes across as greed. What are you really doing this for? Never heard of someone getting to be paid out for benefits not taken. Give yourself a reasonable raise.

Allen Peterson-Mayor listed a long list of duties and responsibilities at first reading. This is what I did in 2008. The budget is bigger but the duties have not changed. City was built on community service. Extremely detrimental reaction and future willing to serve if they think that you as a Council are more interested in money for yourselves than community service. Urge you to reconsider the amount of the raise. 12k-15k raise is reasonable, supports some type of 3% COLA. Meetings at night to allow working class to attend.

Gene Dowling-couple of comments have been repeated over the past few weeks. I do think Council should get a raise. It is a full time job. What petition? Mayor said he hadn't heard about it. I think that was not a truthful answer. At the last meeting it was discussed to have a different amount. Petition to recall all of you

Vincent Ligouri-top of the org. chart is the citizens. Guess what, you're fired. What you're doing is comparable to saying that you're fired. You're not listening to the people. I am not against a salary increase. Start at 12-15K and work up. COLA increase, no benefits. Grade levels for comp. We need citizen participation. Need charter revision for grade levels. High salaries coupled with no term limits equals congress and senate. Two dysfunctional groups who do nothing. Wonderful to have term limits because it cleanses.

Jeff Nay-the greed that you guys are showing, are you out of your minds? How long have you been in office? Raise and benefits for part time work. I vote that all of you be removed immediately.

Patrick Delsodo-have been here longer than probably 2/3 of you. I helped put fires out and volunteered my services for 20 years. Now I do it today on the VFFPB for zero pay. You do deserve compensation, but that much at this time, in this day in age, no. Fix drainage. Palm Coast has never looked this bad. Worst I have ever seen PC. Make things better and then give yourselves raise.

Patrick Miller-I think you received a disservice from previous Council. Timing is everything. The timing couldn't be worse. Maybe look at giving yourselves a smaller raise with an increase each year to get to where you want to be. FLC will give you every resources on where you stand with other cities. If I have elected you then you can represent me. You deserve something, benefits that's another discussion. Small and build up.

Janet Castaneda-unsettling and repugnant to receive 365% increase. Council should represent the public. You should be representing your people. I don't understand why you don't see this as preposterous. Spoke of thievery increasing

costs for others. When you add the cost of benefits it is as much as the original proposed increase. Abandon Ordinance and bring discussion back.

Yvonne Lewis-you want us to believe the raise will give us better candidates. It will bring more candidates, but only interested in the salary not what is best for the community. You're the voice of the people, not yourselves. The raise should not be any more than Fire, EMT, and Police. Other city employees barely get a COLA. If you're not willing to be our voice, then this is all about personal gain. I helped with petitions against this increase. People do not want it.

Chantel Poliga-other people in the City work two jobs to make it. You act like the increase does not affect us. We the people said no. Suggested improvements throughout the City. You say there isn't enough tax money for streetlights, sidewalks, stormwater, but there is enough for this increase? You knew what the salary was when you were elected.

Angela Smith-shared about her business that offers a 4 day summer camp for entrepreneurship.

Mark Lewis Cottonwood-recent special election for mayor. Received multiple qualified candidates who were all happy with the compensation. This salary increase becomes your re-election war chest funded by us. It makes it harder for the average citizens to run for this office because the incumbents will be sitting on more money. COLA on what you've got or maybe a minor increase.

Colleen Oaks-talking about trying to round up better candidates by offering better pay. If that is the case then you all need to step down because you're not qualified. What is good enough for the employees should be good enough for you. COLA is appropriate. I don't want my taxes going up, evidently you do.

Dennis Macdonald-What's wrong here and what rubs everyone wrong is the manner in which this was done. 3/5 of you will decide what happens. You are bullying people of Palm Coast into this raise. The benefits proposed raise the compensation substantially. You need to not move forward on this at this time. We can change this.

Darlene Shelley-the top performing associates in my company were provided a 6-8% increase. Your position is a public servant and should not be compensated as a full time job. More than qualified individuals of all experiences and backgrounds. Part time public servants do not warrant benefits. Listen to the residents. Modest salary increase.

Steve Carr-spoke on the compensation.

Terry Magga-what you're asking for is atrocious. If you think we won't be paying higher taxes, you're wrong. We have one gentleman up there who won't even look at who is speaking. We are all tired and implore you to think about this raise. 3% is more inline with what the economy is right now. Why did you decide you were going to run? It looks like greed to me.

Gene Walker spoke about Council discussion on compensation. You can be voted out and that is up to us, the people. I would like to see where we vote you

a raise. Should get the same percent as employees. Benefits are a disgusting cost. Is it benefits for you or for your family, there's a difference in cost. This should be voted on by us. Ballot costs money but we should get to have a voice.

Paula Lewis-we were told month ago that taxes wouldn't be raised because we don't have a lot of money. Now you want to raise your salary and possibly benefits by raising our taxes. Draining our pockets even deeper.

Tony Amaral-by my account I am the 21st person to speak up about this. You all do a wonderful job, giving time and effort. You all wanted this job knowing what it paid. Is there room for an increase? Yes. But what needs to be understood is that you are not full time employees of the City of Palm Coast. Your job is to guide and counsel employees through Ms. Bevan. Your lowest paid employee to get your goals done, you shouldn't make more than that person. Your compensation should go up, no health benefits.

CM Klufas-willing to discuss the proposal for benefits. Appreciate CM Fanelli's reasearch.

VM Branquinho-would like to see CM Fanelli withdraw his motion. Would like to motion \$12-15K. Former Mayor Jon Netts spoke of the smallest office in City Hall which was created for Council Members. That should be a hint. I don't think we should create a contract without an arbitration. Let the people at the ballot tell us what we deserve.

City Attorney-Neysa Borkert provided a history of Council Compensation and how it was set and changed.

CM Danko-15 years since this Council received a raise? Ans: Attorney Borkert – Yes, 2007.

CM Fanelli-I will receive no additional compensation, this does not impact me. I try to do what is right, not what is easy. It isn't right for the Council members and Mayor to not be compensated fairly for the job they are doing.

Pass

Motion made to be adopted as amended on second reading by Council Member Fanelli III and seconded by Council Member Klufas

Approved - 4 - Mayor David Alfin, Council Member Ed Danko, Council Member Nick Klufas, Council Member John Fanelli III

Denied - 1 - Vice Mayor Eddie Branquinho

I. CONSENT

There were no public comments for the consent agenda.

11. RESOLUTION 2022-XX APPROVING FLEET PURCHASES OF (2) JLG T350 TOW-PRO BOOM LIFT, (1) HYDRAULIC EXCAVATOR, AND (1) TRAILER

R20220056

Pass

Motion made to to be adopted on consent by Council Member Danko and seconded by Vice Mayor Branquinho

Approved - 5 - Mayor David Alfin, Vice Mayor Eddie Branquinho, Council Member Ed Danko, Council Member Nick Klufas, Council Member John Fanelli III

- 12. RESOLUTION 2022-XX APPROVING THE PIGGYBACK OF NJPA/SOURCEWELL, STATE OF MINNESOTA CONTRACT #070121 WITH JOHNSON CONTROLS FOR THE PURCHASING OF EQUIPMENT, PARTS, INSTALLATION, AND SERVICE FOR THE CITY'S HVAC AND BUILDING AUTOMATION SYSTEMS**

R20220057

Pass

Motion made to to be adopted on consent by Council Member Danko and seconded by Vice Mayor Branquinho

Approved - 5 - Mayor David Alfin, Vice Mayor Eddie Branquinho, Council Member Ed Danko, Council Member Nick Klufas, Council Member John Fanelli III

J. OTHER BUSINESS

- 13. APPOINTMENT TO FILL A VACANCY ON THE BEAUTIFICATION AND ENVIRONMENTAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE (BEAC)**

City Clerk presented an overview of this item to City Council. Council concurred to request the applicants attend the next workshop to explain why they would like to be on the BEAC.

K. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Remainder of Public Comments is limited to three (3) minutes each.

Gene Dowd-two questions-status of Waste Pro contract? Question proposed by VM Branquinho for clarification. Video the Mayor took exception to the question and answered on behalf of the City Manger. Ladies do a great job and the employees in the back and on the streets do a great job. Will single out one employee, Chief Forte and provided accolades to Chief.

Sybil Dodson Lucas-are the appointments being held open to the BEAC? Mayor Alfin-consensus of Council is that we should keep it closed for those who already sent in an application.

Dennis McDonald-one non-agenda item that appears. Mr. Carr- can we please do something for Mr. Carr? Suggested creating a residential step down commercial area.

L. DISCUSSION BY CITY COUNCIL OF MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

VM Branquinho-there are things we do here that please us. Yesterday, at 2:47 p.m. I was walking into my house and my neighbor came running over because her daughter was bit by a poisonous snake. Ms. Bevan answered my call for help within 3 minutes.

M. DISCUSSION BY CITY ATTORNEY OF MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Nothing at this time.

N. DISCUSSION BY CITY MANAGER OF MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Procedural item is Reporting of Emergency and Sole Source purchases.

14. REPORTING OF EMERGENCY AND SOLE SOURCE PURCHASES FOR MARCH 2022

O. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 12:19 p.m.

*Respectfully submitted by: Virginia A. Smith, MMC
City Clerk*

15. WORKSHEET